

Statistics and the Evaluation of Evidence for Forensic Scientists

Second Edition

Colin G.G. Aitken

*School of Mathematics,
The University of Edinburgh, UK*

Franco Taroni

*Ecole des Sciences Criminelles and
Institut de Médecine Légale,
The University of Lausanne, Switzerland*



John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

***Statistics and the
Evaluation of Evidence
for Forensic Scientists***

STATISTICS IN PRACTICE

Founding Editor

Vic Barnett

Nottingham Trent University, UK

Statistics in Practice is an important international series of texts which provide detailed coverage of statistical concepts, methods and worked case studies in specific fields of investigation and study.

With sound motivation and many worked practical examples, the books show in down-to-earth terms how to select and use an appropriate range of statistical techniques in a particular practical field within each title's special topic area.

The books provide statistical support for professionals and research workers across a range of employment fields and research environments. Subject areas covered include medicine and pharmaceuticals; industry, finance and commerce; public services; the earth and environmental sciences, and so on.

The books also provide support to students studying statistical courses applied to the above areas. The demand for graduates to be equipped for the work environment has led to such courses becoming increasingly prevalent at universities and colleges.

It is our aim to present judiciously chosen and well-written workbooks to meet everyday practical needs. Feedback of views from readers will be most valuable to monitor the success of this aim.

A complete list of titles in this series appears at the end of the volume.

Statistics and the Evaluation of Evidence for Forensic Scientists

Second Edition

Colin G.G. Aitken

*School of Mathematics,
The University of Edinburgh, UK*

Franco Taroni

*Ecole des Sciences Criminelles and
Institut de Médecine Légale,
The University of Lausanne, Switzerland*



John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

Copyright © 2004 John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester,
West Sussex PO19 8SQ, England
Telephone (+44) 1243 779777

Email (for orders and customer service enquiries): cs-books@wiley.co.uk
Visit our Home Page on www.wileyeurope.com or www.wiley.com

All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, scanning or otherwise, except under the terms of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 or under the terms of a licence issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency Ltd, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP, UK, without the permission in writing of the Publisher. Requests to the Publisher should be addressed to the Permissions Department, John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex PO19 8SQ, England, or emailed to permreq@wiley.co.uk, or faxed to (+44) 1243 770620.

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold on the understanding that the Publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Other Wiley Editorial Offices

John Wiley & Sons Inc., 111 River Street, Hoboken, NJ 07030, USA

Jossey-Bass, 989 Market Street, San Francisco, CA 94103-1741, USA

Wiley-VCH Verlag GmbH, Boschstr. 12, D-69469 Weinheim, Germany

John Wiley & Sons Australia Ltd, 33 Park Road, Milton, Queensland 4064, Australia

John Wiley & Sons (Asia) Pte Ltd, 2 Clementi Loop #02-01, Jin Xing Distripark, Singapore 129809

John Wiley & Sons Canada Ltd, 22 Worcester Road, Etobicoke, Ontario, Canada M9W 1L1

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Aitken, C.G.G.

Statistics and the evaluation of evidence for forensic scientists / Colin G.G. Aitken,
Franco Taroni. — 2nd ed.

p. cm. — (Statistics in practice)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-470-84367-5 (alk. paper)

1. Forensic sciences—Statistical methods. 2. Forensic statistics. 3. Evidence, Expert.
I. Taroni, Franco. II. Title. III. Statistics in practice (Chichester, England)

HV8073.A55 2004

363.23'015195—dc22

2004048016

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0-470-84367-5

Typeset in 10/12pt Photina by Integra Software Services Pvt. Ltd, Pondicherry, India

Printed and bound in Great Britain by TJ International, Padstow, Cornwall

This book is printed on acid-free paper responsibly manufactured from sustainable forestry in which at least two trees are planted for each one used for paper production.

To
Liz, David and Catherine
and
Anna and Wanda

Contents

List of tables	xiii
List of figures	xix
Foreword	xxii
Preface to the first edition	xxv
Preface to the second edition	xxviii
1 Uncertainty in forensic science	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Statistics and the law	2
1.3 Uncertainty in scientific evidence	5
1.3.1 The frequentist method	6
1.3.2 Stains of body fluids	7
1.3.3 Glass fragments	9
1.4 Terminology	12
1.5 Types of data	15
1.6 Probability	16
1.6.1 Introduction	16
1.6.2 A standard for uncertainty	18
1.6.3 Events	20
1.6.4 Subjective probability	21
1.6.5 Laws of probability	23
1.6.6 Dependent events and background information	25
1.6.7 Law of total probability	29
1.6.8 Updating of probabilities	32
2 Variation	35
2.1 Populations	35
2.2 Samples and estimates	37
2.3 Counts	40
2.3.1 Probabilities	40
2.3.2 Summary measures	41
2.3.3 Binomial distribution	43
2.3.4 Multinomial distribution	44
2.3.5 Hypergeometric distribution	45
2.3.6 Poisson distribution	48
2.3.7 Beta-binomial distribution	51
2.4 Measurements	52
2.4.1 Summary statistics	52
2.4.2 Normal distribution	53

2.4.3	Student's <i>t</i> -distribution	60
2.4.4	Beta distribution	62
2.4.5	Dirichlet distribution	63
2.4.6	Multivariate Normal and correlation	64
3	The evaluation of evidence	69
3.1	Odds	69
3.1.1	Complementary events	69
3.1.2	Examples	70
3.1.3	Definition	70
3.2	Bayes' Theorem	72
3.2.1	Statement of the theorem	72
3.2.2	Examples	73
3.3	Errors in interpretation	78
3.3.1	Fallacy of the transposed conditional	79
3.3.2	Source probability error	81
3.3.3	Ultimate issue error	82
3.3.4	Defender's fallacy	82
3.3.5	Probability (another match) error	83
3.3.6	Numerical conversion error	84
3.3.7	False positive fallacy	85
3.3.8	Uniqueness	86
3.3.9	Other difficulties	87
3.3.10	Empirical evidence of errors in interpretation	89
3.4	The odds form of Bayes' theorem	95
3.4.1	Likelihood ratio	95
3.4.2	Logarithm of the likelihood ratio	99
3.5	The value of evidence	101
3.5.1	Evaluation of forensic evidence	101
3.5.2	Summary of competing propositions	105
3.5.3	Qualitative scale for the value of the evidence	107
3.5.4	Misinterpretations	111
3.5.5	Explanation of transposed conditional and defence fallacies	112
3.5.6	The probability of guilt	116
3.6	Summary	118
4	Historical review	119
4.1	Early history	119
4.2	The Dreyfus case	122
4.3	Statistical arguments by early twentieth-century forensic scientists	125
4.4	People v. Collins	126
4.5	Discriminating power	129
4.5.1	Derivation	129
4.5.2	Evaluation of evidence by discriminating power	130
4.5.3	Finite samples	133
4.5.4	Combination of independent systems	135
4.5.5	Correlated attributes	136
4.6	Significance probabilities	141
4.6.1	Calculation of significance probabilities	141
4.6.2	Relationship to likelihood ratio	144
4.6.3	Combination of significance probabilities	147

4.7	Coincidence probabilities	149
	4.7.1 Introduction	149
	4.7.2 Comparison stage	151
	4.7.3 Significance stage	151
4.8	Likelihood ratio	153
5	Bayesian inference	157
5.1	Introduction	157
5.2	Bayesian inference for a Bernoulli probability	160
5.3	Estimation with zero occurrences in a sample	162
5.4	Estimation of products in forensic identification	165
5.5	Bayesian inference for a Normal mean	166
5.6	Interval estimation	170
	5.6.1 Confidence intervals	170
	5.6.2 Highest posterior density intervals	172
	5.6.3 Bootstrap intervals	172
	5.6.4 Likelihood intervals	173
5.7	Odds ratios	175
6	Sampling	179
6.1	Introduction	179
6.2	Choice of sample size	182
	6.2.1 Large consignments	182
	6.2.2 Small consignments	186
6.3	Quantity estimation	190
	6.3.1 Frequentist approach	190
	6.3.2 Bayesian approach	191
6.4	Misleading evidence	197
7	Interpretation	205
7.1	Concepts and court cases	205
	7.1.1 Relevant population	205
	7.1.2 Consideration of odds	206
	7.1.3 Combination of evidence	208
	7.1.4 Specific cases	208
7.2	Pre-assessment and relevant propositions	214
	7.2.1 Levels of proposition	214
	7.2.2 Pre-assessment of the case	217
	7.2.3 Pre-assessment of the evidence	220
7.3	Assessment of value of various evidential types	221
	7.3.1 Earprints	221
	7.3.2 Firearms and toolmarks	223
	7.3.3 Fingerprints	226
	7.3.4 Speaker recognition	228
	7.3.5 Hair	229
	7.3.6 Documents	231
	7.3.7 Envelopes	233
	7.3.8 Handwriting	235
	7.3.9 Paint	239
7.4	Pre-data and post-data questions	239

8	Transfer evidence	245
8.1	The likelihood ratio	245
	8.1.1 Probability of guilt	245
	8.1.2 Justification	246
	8.1.3 Combination of evidence and comparison of more than two propositions	248
8.2	Correspondence probabilities	254
8.3	Direction of transfer	255
	8.3.1 Transfer of evidence from the criminal to the scene	255
	8.3.2 Transfer of evidence from the scene to the criminal	260
	8.3.3 Transfer probabilities	261
	8.3.4 Two-way transfer	270
	8.3.5 Presence of non-matching evidence	271
8.4	Grouping	271
8.5	Relevant populations	274
9	Discrete data	283
9.1	Notation	283
9.2	Single sample	283
	9.2.1 Introduction	283
	9.2.2 General population	286
	9.2.3 Particular population	286
	9.2.4 Examples	286
9.3	Two samples	288
	9.3.1 Two stains, two offenders	288
	9.3.2 DNA profiling	291
9.4	Many samples	292
	9.4.1 Many different profiles	292
	9.4.2 General cases	293
9.5	Relevance of evidence and relevant material	295
	9.5.1 Introduction	295
	9.5.2 Subjective probabilities	296
	9.5.3 Association propositions	296
	9.5.4 Intermediate association propositions	297
	9.5.5 Examples	298
	9.5.6 Two stains, one offender	302
9.6	Summary	304
	9.6.1 Stain known to have been left by offenders	304
	9.6.2 Relevance: stain may not have been left by offenders	305
	9.6.3 Relevance and the crime level	307
9.7	Missing persons	308
	9.7.1 Case 1 (Kuo, 1982)	309
	9.7.2 Case 2 (Ogino and Gregonis, 1981)	309
	9.7.3 Calculation of the likelihood ratio	310
9.8	Paternity: combination of likelihood ratios	312
	9.8.1 Likelihood of paternity	314
	9.8.2 Probability of exclusion in paternity	317

10	Continuous data	319
10.1	The likelihood ratio	319
10.2	Normal distribution for between-source data	321
10.2.1	Sources of variation	322
10.2.2	Derivation of the marginal distribution	322
10.2.3	Approximate derivation of the likelihood ratio	324
10.2.4	Lindley's approach	326
10.2.5	Interpretation of result	327
10.2.6	Examples	328
10.3	Estimation of a probability density function	330
10.4	Kernel density estimation for between-source data	337
10.4.1	Application to medullary widths of cat hairs	339
10.4.2	Refractive index of glass	339
10.5	Probabilities of transfer	342
10.5.1	Introduction	342
10.5.2	Single fragment	342
10.5.3	Two fragments	345
10.5.4	A practical approach to glass evaluation	349
10.5.5	Graphical models for the assessment of transfer probabilities	352
10.6	Approach based on <i>t</i> -distribution	353
10.7	Appendix Derivation of <i>V</i> when the between-source measurements are assumed normally distributed	357
11	Multivariate analysis	359
11.1	Introduction	359
11.2	Description of example	360
11.3	Univariate <i>t</i> -tests	362
11.4	Hotelling's T^2	363
11.5	Univariate Normality, two sources of variation	365
11.6	Multivariate Normality, two sources of variation	366
11.7	Caveat lector	371
11.8	Summary	372
11.9	Appendix	373
11.9.1	Matrix terminology	373
11.9.2	Determination of a likelihood ratio with an assumption of Normality	377
12	Fibres	381
12.1	Introduction	381
12.2	Likelihood ratios in scenarios involving fibres	381
12.2.1	Fibres evidence left by an offender	382
12.2.2	Comments on the fibres scenario	387
12.2.3	Fibres evidence not left by the offender	388
12.2.4	Cross-transfer	389
12.3	Pre-assessment in fibres scenarios	392
12.3.1	The case history	392
12.3.2	Formulation of the pairs of propositions and events	392
12.3.3	Assessment of the expected value of the likelihood ratio	394
12.4	The relevant population of fibres	396

13	DNA profiling	399
13.1	Introduction	399
13.2	Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium	401
13.3	DNA likelihood ratio	404
13.4	Uncertainty	405
13.5	Variation in sub-population allele frequencies	405
13.6	Related individuals	409
13.7	More than two propositions	412
13.8	Database searching	414
	13.8.1 Search and selection effect (double counting error)	418
13.9	Island problem	419
13.10	Mixtures	421
13.11	Error rate	424
14	Bayesian networks	429
14.1	Introduction	429
14.2	Bayesian networks	430
	14.2.1 The construction of Bayesian networks	431
14.3	Evidence at the crime level	437
	14.3.1 Preliminaries	437
	14.3.2 Description of probabilities required	437
14.4	Missing evidence	439
	14.4.1 Preliminaries	439
	14.4.2 Determination of a structure for a Bayesian network	440
	14.4.3 Comments	442
14.5	Error rates	442
	14.5.1 Preliminaries	442
	14.5.2 Determination of a structure for a Bayesian network	443
14.6	Transfer evidence	444
	14.6.1 Preliminaries	444
	14.6.2 Determination of a structure for a Bayesian network	444
	14.6.3 Comment on the <i>transfer</i> node	446
14.7	Combination of evidence	447
14.8	Cross-transfer evidence	449
	14.8.1 Description of nodes	451
	14.8.2 Probabilities for nodes	452
14.9	Factors to consider	452
	14.9.1 Parameter choice	453
14.10	Summary	453
	References	455
	Notation	485
	Cases	489
	Author index	491
	Subject index	499

List of Tables

1.1	Genotypic frequencies for locus <i>LDLR</i> amongst Caucasians in Chicago based on a sample of size 200 (from Johnson and Peterson, 1999).	8
1.2	Refractive index measurements.	10
1.3	Genotype probabilities, assuming Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium, for a diallelic system with allele probabilities p and q .	27
1.4	The proportion of people in a population who fall into the four possible categories of genetic markers.	29
2.1	Probabilities for the number of sixes, X , in four rolls of a fair six-sided die	41
2.2	Intermediate calculations for the variance of the number of sixes, x , in four rolls of a fair six-sided die	43
2.3	Probabilities that a random variable X with a Poisson distribution with mean 4 takes values 0, 1, 2, 3, 4 and greater than 4	50
2.4	Values of cumulative distribution function $\Phi(z)$ and its complement $1 - \Phi(z)$ for the standard Normal distribution for given values of z .	57
2.5	Probabilities for absolute values from the standard Normal distribution function	57
2.6	Percentage points $t_{(n-1)}(P)$ for the t -distribution for given values of sample size n , degrees of freedom $(n - 1)$ and P , and the corresponding point $z(P)$ for the standard Normal distribution.	61
3.1	Two-by-two contingency table for frequencies for the tabulation of patients with or without a disease (S or \bar{S}) given a blood test positive or negative (R or \bar{R}).	74
3.2	Two-by-two contingency table for probabilities for the tabulation of patients with or without a disease (S or \bar{S}) given a blood test positive or negative (R or \bar{R}).	75
3.3	Hypothetical results for deaths amongst a population.	76

In the Preface to the first edition of this book it was commented that the role of statistics in forensic science was continuing to increase and that this was partly because of the debate continuing over DNA profiling which looked as if it would carry on into the foreseeable future. It now appears that the increase is continuing and perhaps at a greater rate than in 1995. Chapter 4 has an additional section on the work of early twentieth-century forensic scientists as it has gradually emerged how far ahead of their time these scientists were in their ideas. Three new chapters have then been introduced before the chapter on transfer evidence. Chapter 7 also includes brief comments on various evidence types for which statistical evaluation is beginning to be developed.