Expanding grounds. The roots of spatial planning in Indonesia
Pauline K.M. van Roosmalen

Introduction
The first notions of spatial planning in Indonesia date from the beginning of the twentieth century and are the outcome of a fundamental administrative change laid down in the Decentralisation Act (Decentralisatiewet). The Decentralisation Act was decreed by the government in 1903 and introduced a new administrative classification that brought an end to the overpowering central administration in Batavia. It paved the way for the enactment of the Local Councils Ordinance (Locale Radenordonnantie) which laid down rules for the establishment of local governments. It was these local governments, or municipalities (gemeenten) that would engage and be involved in the needs, development and planning of their territory. At the time referred to as ‘urban development’ these involvements were the first steps on the way which would lead to spatial planning.

This article is the result of a joint project between the Indonesian Ministry for Settlements and Regional Infrastructure (Departemen Permukiman dan Prasarana Wilayah) in Jakarta and her Dutch counterpart, the Ministry for Housing, Spatial Planning and Environment (Ministerie van Volkshuisvesting, Ruimtelijke Ordening en Milieu) in The Hague that describes the developments of spatial planning in Indonesia since its independence. As many developments, especially those in the 50’s and early 60’s were closely connected to or influenced by developments in town planning in Republik Indonesia before the Second World War I was invited to describe the developments in the first half of the twentieth century. The three year period when Japan ruled over the country is left out as proper material with regard to the theme of this paper during of this period is not available.

Preparatory steps in colonial days
Because of their immediate contact with the problems and issues at stake, the municipal boards realised early on that new and future points of interest as well as existing problems needed to be addressed simultaneously and for all ethnic groups in order to work as effectively as possible. However, true to the idea of decentralisation the government in Batavia was quite reluctant initially to grant any plea for financial, legal, or organisational support. Left on their own with an almost constant shortage of staff, know-how and proper material the municipalities soon decided to join forces and create a platform where thoughts, ideas and experiences could be exchanged and discussed. To suit the action to the word the first so-called Decentralisation congress was organised in 1910. Many were to follow: the congresses became an annual event where local administrators, experts and anyone interested would gather and share thoughts on various themes ranging from ‘health-issues’ to ‘building lines’ and

---

1 This article would never have been written without the help and assistance of the following people: S.C. Buijs, formerly a staff-member of the National Planning Bureau at the ministry in The Hague, prof. ir H.M. Goudappel, dr L.J. Giebels, ir Erik Hofstede of OD205 Planning and Design, and my father in the Netherlands. In Indonesia ir Hendropranoto Suselo of the ministry in Jakarta, ir Soefaat, ir Sidharta, dipl.-ing. Han Awai, ir Adhi Moersid, the employees of the National Archives of the Republic of Indonesia (Arsip Nasional Republik Indonesia), and the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (Lembaga Ilmu Penelitian Indonesia).
2 An Indonesian translation of this article is available in the publication that was presented as a result of the project: N. Jenny, M.T. Hardjatno, and Febi Herta (eds), Sejarah Penataan Ruang Indonesia 1948-2000. Beberapa Ungkapan, Departemen Permukiman dan Prasarana Wilayah, Jakarta, 2004, 9-24.
‘expenses’. During the second congress in 1911 the municipalities established the Association for Local Interests (Vereeniging voor Locale Belangen) and consecutively two periodicals, *Locale Belangen* and *Locale Techniek*. The association and its publications were an important instrument that empowered the municipalities to define their needs and find solutions to materialize their objectives. For the latter the municipalities frequently turned to the Advisor for Decentralisation, a civil servant who came under the Department of Home Affairs and through this department mediated between national and local administrations.

First and foremost, most cities and particularly the large coastal ones, had to deal with an unrelenting rise in population, a huge demand for houses and an ever increasing need for sanitary, infrastructure, and other related improvements. The individual town councils addressed the various issues as well as they possibly could. Semarang in many cases lead the way. Already in 1907 W.T. de Vogel, a physician and member of the Semarang town council, asked the Dutch based architect K.P.C. de Bazal to make some preliminary sketches for an extension plan in the hilly area south of Semarang. Some time later the municipal council officially commissioned Herman Thomas Karsten (1884-1945), an architect who worked as office manager at Henri Maclaine’s architectural office in Semarang, to present a design for this area. Karsten accepted and in 1917 presented his plans for New Candi (Nieuw Tjandi), an extension plan designed to accommodate all ethnic groups in accordance with their living standards and habits. In Surabaya the council already in 1909 acquired a large plot of private land Goebeng as a location for a new European neighbourhood and seven years later it bought the grounds Ketabang and Ngagel for the same reason. At about the same time the Darmo or Dermo area was developed (Figure 1-2). As a result of the intention of the central government to transfer some ministries from Batavia to Bandung, the local council of Bandung from the mid 1910’s onwards worked on a systematic extension of her territory. Local development and building companies were established and already in 1917 the General Engineers- and Architects Bureau (Algemeen Ingenieurs- en Architectenbureau – AIA) presented an extension plan for the northern part of the town (Figure 3). In the very same year Batavia, Buitenzorg, and Medan also presented partial extension plans. In Batavia new designs for the mainly European residential areas Menteng en New Gondangdia were presented in 1918.

Despite all these and other plans that were developed and implemented, town planning as such never seemed to be an issue. This radically changed when Karsten presented his paper ‘Indian Town Planning’ (Indiese Stedebouw) at the Decentralisation congress in 1921. In his paper Karsten argued that the planning of a town was an activity that entailed a vast variety of interconnected activities (social, technological, etc.) that needed to be addressed accordingly. His plea for a methodological approach and the creation of organic town plans with an eye for social dimensions and good aesthetics were new, groundbreaking, and received much acclaim in the Indies as well as in the Netherlands (Granpré Molière 1922).³

---

³ In 1922 M.J. Granpré Molière, professor for architecture at the Institute of Technology (Technische Hoogeschool) in Delft, the Netherlands, praised ‘Indian Town Planning’ for its clarity and, considering the complexity of the assignment in the colony, its comprehensiveness.
Figure 1. Plan Surabaya with projection of Plan Dermo (1916)


Figure 2. Building Plan Dermo (1916)


Figure 3. Extension Plan North Bandung (1917)

Extension Plan North Bandung, 1917, scale 1:10,000. Design: General Engineers- and Architects Bureau (AIA).

With the mediation of the advisor for decentralisation, the repeated requests by the local councils for help and assistance with regard to the various issues related to planning gradually called forth response from the government in Batavia. Increasingly aware of the need and advantages of support, the government from the mid 1920’s onward slowly but surely decided to deal with various matters. Among them were the agreement to allow commercially based limited liability companies (naamloze vennootschappen) to get involved in the housing industry (1925), a circular letter to municipalities containing guidelines for urban extensions and housing (1926), an addition to existing municipal priority rights on land (1926), and the provision of up to fifty percent subsidy and guidelines for kampong improvement projects (1928) (Rückert 1930:169). With regard to planning decisive steps were taken in 1930. It was in this year that two committees were appointed to study the regulations that were ordained by various municipalities to organize the development of their town plan. Members of the Building Line Committee (Rooilijncommissie) also sat on the larger Building Restriction Committee (Bouwbeperkingencommissie) (Regeeringsalamanak 1931, 1932; Bouwbeperkingscommissie 1932). Four years later the government

---

4 Municipalities and the government owned respectively 25 and 75 per cent of the shares of the public limited companies for housing. In 1929 public limited companies for housing existed in Batavia, Buitenzorg, Cirebon, Madioen, Makassar, Modjokerto, Palembang, Pekalongan, Semarang, Soekaboei, Soerabaja, and Tegal.

5 The official designation of the Building Restriction Committee was ‘Committee assigned to investigate all building restrictions emanating from both general and local ordinances, to advice the government on the desirability to formulate legal regulations, and, when the committee affirms this desirability, to devise such regulations’ (‘Commissie welke tot taak zal hebben het instellen van een onderzoek, naar alle, zowel uit algemeene als locale verordeningen voortspruitende bouwbeperkingen, alsmede om de regering van advies te dienen nopens de vraag of het wenselijk is om ten aanzien van die beperkingen wettelijke regelingen in het leven te roepen en om, voor zoover deze vraag bevestigend wordt beantwoord, zoodanige regelingen te ontwerpen’). When the committee was inaugurated the following members were appointed: S. Bastiaans (inspector Agricultural Affairs, chairman), mr C.C.J. Maassen (inspector Agricultural Affairs, secretary), R.T.A. Abdoerachman (Regent Meester Cornelis), A. Bagchus (mayor Semarang), mr P.A. Blaauw (member of the Provincial Executive of West-Java), C. Citroen (architect Surabaya), L.G.C.A. van der Hoek (Resident Batavia),
appointed the Town Planning Committee (Stadsvormingscommissie). Apart from mr. P.A. Blauw (member of the Provincial Executive of West-Java), A. Bagchus (mayor Semarang), C. Citroen (architect Surabaya), M.H. Thamrin (member Volksraad, or People’s Council), Karsten, A. van Roosendaal (director Building and Housing Inspection Department Bandung), and W. Westmaas (architect Batavia) who also sat on the Building Restriction Committee the initial committee consisted of R.T.A. Achmad Probonggoro (Regent Batavia), dr A.J.R. Heinsius (acting senior official first class at the decentralisation bureau), mr. H. Fievez de Malines van Ginkel (Resident Batavia), ir J.G. de Willigen (head Department Sanitation and Social Housing at the Office for Public Health), ir W. Lemei (architect Surabaya), and mr. A.P.G. Hens (acting adjunct inspector Agricultural Affairs at the Department of Interior, secretary). The committee was chaired by prof. dr J.H.A. Logemann (professor at the Law School (Rechtshoogeschool) in Batavia). The Town Planning Committee was meant to define, methodise and legally embed town planning as a discipline by studying and defining historical and starting points of departure for town planning and by recommending the direction into which the discipline should develop.

Four years after its inauguration the committee in 1938 presented a draft of a Town Planning Ordinance (Stadsvormingsordonnantie) and a comparatively rather extensive explanatory memorandum (Stadsvormingsordonnantie 1938, Toelichting 1938). The tenor of the ordinance clearly stated its purpose: the town planning regulations were

‘to organise construction and building, by local governments as well as by others, in order to guarantee the development of towns in accordance with their social and geographical characteristics and their expected growth. Town planning needed to strive for a proportional division of the needs of all population groups corresponding to their disposition, and to create a harmonic functioning of the town as a whole. All this with consideration of the environment and the position of a town in a wider context’.

The draft was presented and discussed during a planning workshop organized by the Association for Local Interests in 1939. A great number of professionals from various backgrounds but with loads of practical experience in the field of planning arrived from all over the archipelago to join the workshop. Notwithstanding the criticism this draft (naturally) encountered after its presentation, the debates during the workshop and the official inauguration of a Planning Study Group (Planologische Studiegroep) clearly indicated the importance and need to formulate a methodology.
and the interest and desire to expand planning beyond the boundaries of towns (Planologische 1939, Samenstelling 1939). They also revealed a deliberateness and passion to make this happen.

Developments seemed to be going in the right direction. The appointment of Karsten as lecturer for planning at the Institute of Technology (Technische Hoogeschool) in Bandung in 1941 was a recognition of his many contributions to the development of town planning as a profession and a the first step towards expansion of the discipline in the direction of planning. However, the imminent political situation in Europe and later on world wide, the German occupation of the Netherlands in 1940 and the Japanese invasion of the colony in 1942, soon brought these developments to a standstill. The approval and enactment of the draft Town Planning Ordinance and coinciding developments had to be postponed until after the Second World War.

Immediate post-war developments: steppingstones towards spatial planning
When the Second World War was over, the Indonesian declaration of independence on August 17, 1945 made it clear that a revision of the administrative configuration was necessary and inevitable. However, despite increasing international political pressure to leave the country the Dutch government decided not to back down to the request for Indonesian independence. In the meantime administrative adjustments were made. The colony was no longer governed by a Governor-General and Director of the Ministries but by a Lieutenant Governor-General and Secretaries of State. The advisor for decentralisation was dispensed. Furthermore the 1924 Province Ordinance (Provincieordonnantie) was given further elaboration when eight provinces were designated: West Java, Central Java, East Java, Sumatra, Borneo, Sulawesi, Maluku and the Sunda Islands. The existing pre-war administrative entities of residencies, municipalities and regencies were maintained (Niessen 1999:61).

As a result of the war large parts of the country and particularly the towns were in shambles and in dire need of reconstruction and rebuilding. This not only required a revision of recent developments but also a study and incorporation of future ones. In order to address this huge task the Department of Transport and Public Works was reorganized and renamed the Department for Public Works and Reconstruction. Despite the reorganisation three major problems remained that needed to be addressed: the absence of knowledgeable professionals, a good organisational infrastructure, and a legal foundation to work on.

Indispensable: organisation and education
The (temporary) abolition of many of the pre-war institutions and the extensive and new post-war planning and building assignments made it hard - if not impossible – to continue work as before. For one, the Decentralisation Office no longer existed which made it necessary to revise procedures and responsibilities. To ensure planning in the

---

7 The Planning Study Group mainly consisted of members that earlier on constituted the Town Planning Committee. Except Logemann and Karsten, ir W. van de Broek d’Obrenan, R.T.A. Abas Soeria Nata Atmadja, ir A.H. van Assen, prof. dr G.M. van der Kolff, ir W. Lemei, dr W.M.F. Mansvelt, ir R.C.A.F. J Nessel, dr F.M. Razoux Schultz, Moh. Soesilo, ing. Werner Sörensen, ir J.A.C. Tobi and ir M. Valkenburg participated in the study group. Prof. ir C.P. Wolff Schoemaker and ir J.L. Moens were invited to participate but did not yet participate in 1939. It is not known whether they joined the study group after 1939.

8 ‘[…] een land met zoo krachtig groeiende steden als Indië kan zonder scha geen stedenbouwkundige wetgeving ontberen.’ (Planologische 1939:107)
post-war situation could (and would) continue as normal as possible methodology, organisation, and regulations needed to be adjusted.

In an attempt to channel the reconstruction works proposals for the establishment of a central planning organisation were soon made. The first one as early as 1945. In ‘On the desirability of the establishment of a Central Planning Office for Java and Madura’ published in de Opdracht, dr ir W.B. Kloos described the necessity and significance to centralize and coordinate planning in order to maximize prosperity and beauty and boost the economy (Kloos 1945). He suggested to initially limit the activities of a central organisation to Java and Madura. Later on they could be extended to the whole archipelago. In Kloos’ point of view the main objectives of the central organisation would be to set up general directions for planning and guidelines for the urban developments of municipalities, test new works on the basis of these directives, and prepare town plans for those towns that were not sufficiently equipped to do so themselves. Kloos suggested that the first plan, a general development plan for Java, would address five separate but intertwined aspects of planning: agriculture, industrialisation, colonisation (transmigration), recreation, and traffic. Additionally town planning in relation with kampong improvements and the environmental protection of the man-made landscape in general and desa’s in particular, were to be added.

Though Kloos’ suggestion for a central organisation were endorsed, the elaboration of his ideas was heavily criticised by F.M. Razoux Schultz, former leader of the Department for Sanitation and Housing at the Department of Health, and ir J.C.K. van Toorenburg, former principal engineer at the disposal of the Governor of West Java. Both critics uttered strong doubts about the necessity to centralize planning. First of all because they were of the opinion that despite its decentralised administration Indonesia was still very much organised from Batavia as the centre of government – which made the set up of a central organisation rather superfluous, and secondly because they did not understand the need for a national policy on the occupation and use of land in a country where space was still available in abundance. Van Toorenburg furthermore was of the opinion that first of all towns were in urgent need of proper planning. Rather than setting up a central organisation that would cover the whole range of planning issues throughout the archipelago, he therefore suggested to create a central office that would provide guidance and advice to set up town plans. Little by little this central organisation could then pass these assignments on to local offices and extend its sphere of activity to a regional and maybe a national level. Razoux Schultz’ remarks focussed on sanitation. In order to prevent a regression to pre-war circumstances and in view of the lack of interest for the topic on both national and local level, he emphasized the necessity to centrally address this issue and assure a decent building by-law.

Another prominent person who won his spurs in the pre-war colony and argued in favour of a central planning organisation was Jacobus Pieter Thijsse (1896-1981). Thijsse, a civil engineer who had worked for the local Department of Public

---

9 The proposal by Comtech Batavia that Logemann referred to in his advice in 1946 to the Lieutenant Governor-General could not be located. Logemann advised the Lieutenant Governor-General on the proposals by Kloos and Comtech Batavia in his capacity as Minister of Overseas Territories (Overzeesche Gebiedsdeelen). He also offered to supply information on the practice of planning based on his pre-war experience as chairman of the Town Planning Committee (1934-1938). Arsip Nasional Republik Indonesia, Jakarta (ANRI) Algemene Secretarie en het Kabinet van de Gouverneur-Generaal 1944-1950 (AS) no. 923, Letter by Logemann dd. 22-3-1946.

10 ANRI AS no. 925, Correspondentie betr. voorstel tot instelling Centrale Planologische Dienst voor Java en Madoera (1946).
Works in Bandung since 1921 and was appointed professor for planning and sanitation at the Technological Institute in Bandung in 1946, made his first public statement on planning when he presented a paper during the planning workshop in 1939. In his lecture Thijsse advocated that the municipal development companies should extend their activities beyond the more affluent classes and incorporate them into the realm of town planning regulations (Planologische 1939). The different stand he took with regard to the responsibilities and working procedures of the municipal development companies and his plea for a fundamental change in the existing status quo was much appreciated, and considered an important contribution to the workshop (Thijsse 1939).

After the war Thijsse soon earned a reputation in the field of planning - a name that lasted many decades, in as well as outside Indonesia. In his opinion three elements were indispensable with regard to planning: expertise, education, and legislation. His plea for a central planning organisation was both pragmatic and ideological. As the war left Indonesian society administratively, economically and socially completely disrupted and large urban and rural areas in dire need of reconstruction and with only 15 professionals left who had some kind of training or expertise in town planning to cover the archipelago, Thijsse argued that reconstruction work would be utterly impossible without coordinating supply and demand. Faced with these problems he therefore proposed the set-up of a central organisation that would assemble people and knowledge, assess needs, and contribute solutions. In line with European and North-American developments Thijsse envisioned an organisation that would expand its sphere of action to the field of general spatial planning rather than stick to the field of town planning only. It was to work according to a tripartite methodology consisting of advise, coordination, and research. To do so, two major adjustments were necessary: the incorporation of survey before plan and a revision of the organisation. Given the abolition of the Decentralisation Office, Thijsse deemed it useful to place the Planning Bureau under the Ministry of Transport and Public Works.

Thijsse’s arguments were soon consented. On May 1, 1946 the (Central) Planning Bureau ([Centraal] Planologisch Bureau – (C)PB) was established as a division of the Department for Public Works and Reconstruction. (C)PB’s main objective was to address and coordinate reconstruction works, whether on a local, regional or even national level. The principle from which the (C)PB worked was that local town plans would at all times be secondary to the reconstruction works and temporary, due to the general lack of data necessary for a proper plan. Once the

---


12 NAi TA, ‘Aantekeningen over de Stadsvormingsordonnante’.

13 Thijsse, Soesilo, and ir S. Schijfsma were the only town planners at the CPB with pre-war planning experience in the archipelago. The other members were all architects. The new CPB-members were an Indonesian planner, five Dutch professionals (two planners, an architect, a sociologist, a legist), and an administrative staff. Initially referred to as the ‘Planning Bureau’, it is not clear when the name of the office was changed into Central Planning Bureau. Therefore the addition ‘Central’ is placed in brackets. NAi TA, Jac.P. Thijsse, ‘Een vergelijking tussen Nederland en Nederlands Oost Indië tijdens de laatste eeuwisseling’ (ca. 1980), 20.

14 The plans PB developed dealt with a period of 25 to 30 years and thus, as Thijsse himself remarked, far outstretched the period what was to be considered the reconstruction period. NAi TA, Jac.P. Thijsse, ‘Werkzaamheden van het Planologisch Bureau van het Departement van Verkeer en Waterstaat over het eerste jaar van zijn bestaan’. ANRI AS no. 925, Correspondentie betr. voorstel tot instelling Centrale Planologische Dienst voor Java en Madoera (1946).
situation stabilized and more data were available, all plans were to be revised and brought up to date. Another important objective of the bureau was to warrant a legal basis for town planning activities in territories that were as yet without autonomous constitution. Therefore (C)PB instantly started to work on the formulation of an emergency ordinance – for which purpose it heavily relied on the draft of the Town Planning Ordinance of 1938.

After a fact-finding mission to the cities outside Java that suffered most from the bombardments, (C)PB’s first assignment was to draw up reconstruction and improvement plans. With demolition up to eighty percent and with hardly any material, staff or know-how at their disposal the task was enormous. Nevertheless (C)PB within four months mapped out the destructed areas, surveyed the needs and set out guidelines for reconstruction works (including improvements of previously existing unfavourable situations). When the State of East Indonesia was established in December 1946, (C)PB handed its Minister of Public Works and Reconstruction a reconstruction plan and building regulations for Makassar, a town plan for Ternate and an emergency town planning ordinance (Niessen 1999:66). The building regulations for Ternate and the reconstruction plans for Menado, Ambon and Kupang were presented a few months later. To address the vast scale of the devastations and to seize the opportunity to improve the awkward but frequent occurring ribbon developments in the northern region of Sulawesi, (C)PB developed its first regional plan for Minahasa and the towns Amurang, Tomohon, Tondano and Bitung.

Barely finished with the first assignments in East Indonesia, Thijsse left in August 1946 for a working visit to Europe. The aim of the visit was to study the organisation and particularly the curriculum of planning in the Netherlands and other western countries. Being among fellow planners and able to compare the European and the Indonesian situation, the visit increasingly affirmed Thijsse’s outlook that a Dutch or European planning practice could not simply be copied and pasted to Indonesia. Furthermore the study tour confirmed his conviction that the provision of a thorough education in planning was of the utmost importance for the future of Indonesia.

Indonesian planning reality in the second half of the 1940’s was not the ideal planners’ world. Because of the lack of manpower and expertise, the idea to compose teams consisting of various professionals with their own particular expertise –which was the ideal in planning– was not a very realistic prospect for the near future. Addressing pragmatic planning issues not only required tackling practical issues though. The need for a professional, intellectual climate and debate was indeed a

---

15 NAi TA, Jac.P. Thijsse, ‘Werkzaamheden van het Planologisch Bureau van het Departement van Verkeer en Waterstaat over het eerste jaar van zijn bestaan’.
16 J.A. Harms and G.H. Voorhoeve were sent to Menado. Private collection Erica Bogaers, Amsterdam (Bogaers), Letter by ir G.H. Voorhoeve dd. 11-9-1984 to Erica Bogaers.
17 The figure is mentioned in an undated and unsigned note, NAi TA.
18 The State of East Indonesia was established in December 1946 and consisted of the districts Bali, Flores, Lombok, South Moluccas, North Moluccas, Minahasa, Singahe Talaud, South Sulawesi, Central Sulawesi, North Sulawesi, Sumba islands, Sumbawa, Timor. Its capital was Denpasar.
20 NAi TA, Jac.P. Thijsse, ‘Werkzaamheden van het Planologisch Bureau van het Departement van Verkeer en Waterstaat over het eerste jaar van zijn bestaan’.
necessity to create a sound professional and intellectual environment. In that respect Karsten’s appointment as associated lecturer for planning at the Bandung Institute of Technology in 1941 had been a step in the right direction even though planning at the time was still very much in its infancy. Thijsse’s post-war appointment as associated lecturer - and subsequently professor - for planning and sanitation at the Bandung institute as of March 1946 did not seem to do be a change for the better. Because, although he weekly lectured 2.5 hours on planning, Thijsse judged this as insufficient to turn out good planners. In his opinion the majority of the civil engineers that graduated from the institute were still incompetent town planners with insufficient understanding of and feeling for the aesthetics of planning, despite their training.22

From that point of view Thomas Nix’ dissertation Contribution to the morphology of town planning, in particular for Indonesia (Bijdrage tot de vormleer van de stedebouw in het bijzonder voor Indonesië) was a great contribution to town planning in Indonesia in general, and the education of future Indonesian planners in particular (Nix 1949). In his book Nix, an architect who before the war worked at the architectural and engineering office of Hulswit and Fermont, Weltevreden and Ed. Cuypers, Amsterdam, in an orderly way described the elements that make up and should be integrated into a town plan. Just like the planning process, Nix’ book was divided in four distinct phases. After a few comparative notes on town planning in the Netherlands and Indonesia and a definition of the Indonesian town, Nix described the global town plan. Then he moved to the detailed design schemes and the various ‘other’ elements such as roads, squares, parks, playing fields, cemeteries, etc. He wound up with an extensive description of the various building types that would be grouped in the ‘built circle’ (bouwkring).

What is remarkable about the study is the limited bibliography Nix consulted: only sixteen titles are mentioned. Nix’ heavy reliance on only a handful of pre-war studies seems to confirm the absence of relevant and useful (reference) material on town planning in Indonesia. And even though Nix did not include a number of relevant and important texts (i.e. Karsten’s ‘Indian Town Planning’) his bibliography seems to comply with the frequent complaints about the lack of information - repeatedly heard before and after the war.23

Despite the criticism of Thijsse and others that Nix’ dissertation candidly adapted the works and ideas of Karsten cum suis, it was at the same time highly valued as it was the first publication that described the application of the town planning morphology to an Indonesian context. Therefore the negative qualification that the book was more of a manual to planning than a scientific study, at the same time was a positive characteristic as it did fill in a gap that had existed for a long time already.

But Nix’ book was not yet available in the immediate years after the war. In those years the only references and guidelines available were those inherited from the pre-war period. And though not insignificant, neither in number nor in content, the lack of organisational structure and procedures and the abundance of new needs and demands, still created a situation that very much resembled a tabula rasa. The post-


23 Another reason for the concise nature of Nix’ bibliography could be the (temporary) unavailability of literature as a result of the war. As Nix took his Ph.D.-degree at the Delft Institute of Technology I do not think this is a very plausible explanation though, as the library of the Faculty for Architecture holds an extensive collection of Indonesian pre-war publications on architecture and town planning.
war planners were lucky in one respect though as there was a draft available for an ordinance on town planning. Because even though its pre-war content was too limited and not completely suited to the post-war needs, it was still considered a good legal basis to temporarily justify for any planning activities. Thijsse’s repetitive pleas for the need of a legal tool to support any planning activities were met when the Town Planning Ordinance was nationally enforced in 1948. Using the 1938 draft ordinance as a point of departure, it was meant to provisionally provide planners with an instrument to legally address the extraordinary but temporary post-war planning conditions.\(^{24}\)

**Planning institutionalised: Town Planning Ordinance 1948**

One of the main causes that founded planning in Indonesia was the national assessment of the Town Planning Ordinance for Indonesia in 1948 for those areas that were under Dutch control. The approbation of this ordinance not only finally enacted the draft version of 1938 – and thus the various measures that had already been taken in the 1920’s in order to streamline town planning – it also seemed a recognition of the importance and contributions of planning for society. The decision to fall back on the pre-war draft for the Town Planning Ordinance and to adjust it to current needs and demands was by no means a luxury. Regardless of political circumstances pragmatic arguments such as the extent of the post-war devastations and dire needs, the shortage of knowledge and men, and the necessity for a legal foundation and a working procedure made it a most understandable and natural decision.

The first adaptation of the post-war situation is expressed in the proclamation of the 1948 Town Planning Ordinance. The full title reads: ‘Town planning. Regulations to ensure a well-considered town planning, in particular in the interest of a quick and effective reconstruction of territories stricken by the turmoil of war’.\(^{25}\) Besides a few changes to meet the current circumstances and needs, the text of the 1948 ordinance primarily corresponded to the 1938 draft version. Opening with definitions of the terminology being used, the first chapter rounded up with the various responsibilities and tasks of the various administrative levels involved.\(^{26}\) Subsequently the second chapter described a diverse range of various aspects of the town planning procedures: the various elements that a town plan consists of, the handling of existing works, the building line (rooilijn), and the procedure to assess the various elements of the town plan.\(^{27}\) Furthermore regulations regarding obligations to endure and allow the construction of specific works (drains, roads), various licenses (building, construction, operating), mandates (improvements, clearance), and supervision of construction were described. The third chapter dealt with the rights and the extent of indemnifications.\(^{28}\) The only change in this chapter to the 1938 version was the addition of the clause on the regulation of the rights of mortgages. Like the third, the fourth chapter, on expenses related to planning, basically remained unaltered. The last chapter, on transitional and final provisions, was extended with three new clauses. Two of them were important as they were an extension of the

---

\(^{24}\) NAI TA, ‘Aantekeningen over de Stadsvormingsordonnantie’.

\(^{25}\) Staatsblad van Nederlandsch-Indië 168 (1948).

\(^{26}\) Defensive works were not liable to the Town Planning Ordinance.

\(^{27}\) A significant difference between the 1938 and the 1948 ordinance was the adjustment in the assessment procedure that was necessary due to the abolition of the advisor for the decentralisation.

\(^{28}\) For the regulation on the entitlement to damages as a result of planning measures, the Town Planning Ordinance heavily leaned on theory and practice of municipal ordinances for compensations. NAI TA, J.W. Keiser, ‘Ruimtelijke Ordening in het Indoneesië van omstreeks 1950’ (1980), 22.
initial applicability of the ordinance. The first one, clause 51 widened the field of application by stipulating the possibilities of the ordinance to towns and other administrative entities that as yet lacked municipal status but did show or were soon expected to show signs of urban development. The second one, clause 52, provided the possibility to temporarily transfer powers to non-municipal entities in order to advance a wider implementation of the ordinance. The only element left out compared to the Town Planning Ordinance was the explanatory supplement. Although no reference is made to any such document, it might nonetheless be fair to assume that the text of the 1938 Explanatory Supplement, while aware of the altered clauses, was considered to also pertain to the 1948 Town Planning Ordinance.

The government of East-Indonesia was the first to decide it wanted to apply the Town Planning Ordinance for its territory. It did so on October 13, 1947. A few months later on July 23, 1948 the ordinance was granted national legitimacy and announced in the law gazette, Staatsblad van Indonesië. Soon after the Lieutenant Governor-General appointed fifteen cities and areas where, due to recent and future urban development, the ordinance was in dire need of enforcement. Subsequently the ordinance came into operation in Bandjermasin (East-Indonesia) as of January 1, 1949, and later that year in Padang (Sumatra), Batavia, Tegal, Pekalongan, Semarang, Salatiga, Soerabaja, Malang, Tjilatjap, Tangerang, Bekassi and the areas surrounding Kebajoran and Pasar Minggoe (Java). Soon after the establishment of the Town Planning Ordinance the Town Planning Regulation (Stadsvormingsverordening), a tool to execute the Town Planning Ordinance, was decreed. Again first to East Indonesia and on September 5, 1949 for all areas where the Town Planning Ordinance gained force of law.

The modification of the intentions and scope of the original ordinance and the adaptations with regard to the new administrative system were more than just a play of words. They reveal the awareness of the need to review recent developments and achievements, anticipate current and future planning needs and fuse them all into a workable methodology. To guarantee the planning of towns or other areas that faced or expected extensive urban developments would continue despite their lack of professionals and the right administrative structure, adjustments were inevitable as many developing areas were not governed by local councils nor disposed of the proper organisational infrastructure. This not only implied they were not equipped with the necessary departments to design and implement a town plan, it also meant that as the instructions on town planning stipulated that a town plan could only be legalised by a local council. In other words: without a town council no town plan could be legalised. To find a way out of this administrative and legal deadlock, adjustments were essential to be able to work as effectively as possible. This for example lead to one of (C)PB’s objectives namely to take over tasks of those local governments that were not (yet) sufficiently equipped to address planning issues

---

29 The available documents do not give a decisive answer to the question whether and to what extend the enactment was enforced due to lack of other or better alternatives. ANRI AS no. 925, letter by H. van der Wal dd. 7-2-1948 to the Lieutenant Governor-General.
30 Staatsblad voor Nederlandsch-Indië 168 (1948).
31 Staatsblad voor Indonesië 331 (1948); Staatsblad voor Indonesië 241 (1949).
32 These adaptations were made after careful consideration between the Departments of Public Works and Reconstruction, Justice and Home Affairs of East Indonesia. ANRI AS no. 925, Letter by the Director of Home Affairs and General Government Commissioner of East Indonesia dd. 26-6-1947 No. A.Z.30/1/38 to the Minister of Foreign Affairs of East Indonesia.
themselves. In practice this meant that for the time being the director of the Department Public Works and Reconstruction would design and assess town plans.

Once the Town Planning Ordinance gained force of law the entity to which it was applicable was obliged to design a town plan, detailed building schemes and building by-laws. The first plan, the town plan, was the result of extensive research to establish the amount and dimensions of the various needs. Designed on a small scale the town plan was a survey of the various functions and their mutual arrangement, divided in major and minor ‘circles’ (kringen). Because of their rather sketchy nature no rights could be derived from these plans. The next step in the design process was an elaboration of the zoning schemes. Designed on a larger scale these plans were more detailed. Once approved they replaced the town plan and had legal implications. The building by-law at last, described the conditions for all building types in accordance with the aforementioned plans. In conjunction this set of three meant to provide the means and possibilities to arrange and guarantee an efficient, economical and aesthetic spatial planning of any town or settlement.

Despite the clear-cut procedure reality often proved unruly. Thus it sometimes happened that a town had the disposal of a building by-law even though the Town Planning Ordinance was not yet applicable to them, and vice versa. Such for example was the case in Ambon and Menado (that did have a building by-law but were not inserted in the Town Planning Ordinance) and Tegal (that was included in the Town Planning Ordinance but had not building by-law). Furthermore the legal status of the by-laws often was disputable because despite the fact that they were consistently applied, they were not always approved by the local and national government. In that respect the post-war period mirrored the pre-war period when town plans and detailed building schemes were applied as though they were legalised – even when they were not.

Expanding territories: the Committee for Spatial Planning
Structuring the methodology was an important requisite to accommodate the initial necessary rebuilding and planning works. But Thijsse and his men did not stop there. Being confronted with several planning problems they soon realized that haphazard solutions would not suffice in the long run and that other means and measurements would be needed. The widening of the planning discipline in Europe and the United States of America towards (spatial) planning seemed a natural and inevitable direction for Indonesian planning as well.

With regard to planning activities in non-urban areas ir A.M. Semawi, Secretary of State of the Department of Public Works and Reconstruction, in September 1948 reported to the Lieutenant Governor-General that this was a completely different matter. There were many intertwining aspects involved in one plan, such as agriculture, cultivated crops, mining, and traffic, that demanded a different and broader approach than regular town planning. He therefore suggested arranging interdepartmental studies for areas outside the municipal boundaries that would incorporate the expertise of the various ministries and experts involved in the rural areas.

33 ANRI AS no. 925, Letter by H. van der Wal dd. 7-2-1948 to the Lieutenant Governor-General.
34 NAI TA, ‘Aantekeningen over de Stadsvormingsordonnantie’.
35 NAI TA, ‘Aantekeningen over de Stadsvormingsordonnantie’.
37 Bogaers, Letter by J.W. Keiser dd. 16-10-1951 to ir H. Lüning.
Semawi’s suggestion didn’t fall on deaf ears. On October 8, 1948 the Committee for the Regulation of Spatial Planning in Non-urban Areas (Regeringscommissie voor de Ruimtelijke Ordening in Niet-stedelijke Gebieden) was set up as part of the Department of Public Works and Reconstruction. Chaired by Thijsse the committee consisted of representatives of the various ministries involved and with two other (C)PB-members, ir J.H. Schijfsma and Moh. Susilo. Between December 21, 1948 and July 7, 1950 the committee in various compositions met nine times.

In his opening speech for the first meeting Thijsse referred to Town Planning Ordinance as the predecessor of ‘spatial planning’. He recollected that the ordinance was composed after thorough investigations lead by Logemann and inspired by the relentless energy and drive of Karsten. He also remarked however that, despite the employability of the ordinance to regular planning demands, the current and future circumstances demanded a broader approach. Like town planning spatial planning concerned itself with the destination of land after considering all the interests involved. As a major difference between town and spatial planning Thijsse pointed out that considerations of interests in a town were basically among private landowners and tenants, whereas considerations outside the towns were much more to do with spheres of influence and job demarcations between the various departments. Given the differences in focus and scale and the current post-war demands, Thijsse deemed it necessary and inevitable to extend the sphere of planning activities beyond the boundaries of local authorities and expand it to regional areas. Based on the same demographic or other socio-graphic surveys that proper town planning was based on, he considered regional planning the only solution to overcome and anticipate the otherwise gradually arising imbalance between town and country. Thijsse stated that the various members (negara) of the future federal government were to be responsible for their own spatial planning. He also stated however that due to the prevailing shortage of planners, the organisation of spatial planning for the various regions in the archipelago would temporarily need to be centrally organised.

During the second meeting on January 15, 1949 the committee discussed and confirmed the need for country planning and the need to incorporate economic,
financial and social issues into the realm of planning. It also made sure that the work and activities of the planning bureau of the Office for Land Use (Dienst Landinrichting) in Bogor would not interfere with the works of the central organisation for spatial planning. Last but not least the committee agreed on the need of an act that would warrant plans and procedures, and appointed a committee to draw up the main points for such an act.

Following the transfer of sovereignty: repercussions and new directions
The Dutch recognition of the independent Republic of Indonesia in 1949 initially hardly seemed to have major consequences for the spatial planning praxis on a daily basis. Apart from the fact that Dutch citizens in leading position were replaced by Indonesian colleagues no major changes were introduced or conducted until 1957. This year the Indonesian and international community decided the uncompromising Dutch attitude to hand over control over New Guinea to Indonesia was no longer negotiable. As a result Indonesia terminated all relationships with the Netherlands which subsequently lead to the departure of 50,000 Dutch citizens.

The immediate and long-term impact of this development caused a fundamental change to the coexistent working relationship between Indonesians and Dutch. With regard to town planning these events caused a rift in a historically grown relationship where visions and opinions were exchanged, put to the test, and adjusted. It also heralded new changes and possibilities for Indonesia though. With regard to planning the departure of Dutch professionals in 1957 lead to a temporary disappearance of their specific knowledge, a revision of the educational system and the first arrival of professors and planners from the United States of America who worked according to different paradigms. Slowly but surely a new society emerged.

Moving on: the Bill on Spatial Planning
Rather than awaiting upcoming events after the official transfer of sovereignty Thijsse offered the Secretary of State of Public Works and Reconstruction his resignation as head of (C)PB on December 8, 1949. Considering his close affiliation with Karsten before the war, his experience and knowledge of planning, and contributions to the profession before and after the war, he recommended Susilo to be appointed as his successor. When it became obvious ir Sutoto, Secretary-General at the Ministry of Public Works and Power (Pekerjaan Umum dan Tenaga), was not going to follow this recommendation Susilo decided to resign from the (C)PB as of April 1, 1950. Instead of Susilo, Kartanagara Purwadiningrat was appointed Director of the renamed National Agency for Spatial Planning (Jawatan Tata Ruangan Negara). For reasons unclear he was soon succeeded by ir Hadinoto.

The departure of two men who had been deeply involved in planning and reconstruction works from the start bereft (C)PB of two valuable staff members, but enriched the newly established Faculty for Architecture in Bandung. Accommodated

---

40 The activities of the Planning Bureau at the Office for Land Use merely involved studies on suitability of soil for a particular cultivated crop, rainfall, etc.
41 The so-called ‘Editorial Committee’ met weekly and was chaired by mr G.C. Suermanndt, senior official at the Department of Justice. Mr J.W. Keiser was secretary. Other members were mr H. Aa (official at the Department of Justice), Thijsse, and Susilo. NAI TA, J.W. Keiser, ‘Ruimtelijke Ordening in het Indonesië van omstreeks 1950’ (1980).
in the buildings of the former Bandung Institute of Technology as a division of the newly established University of Indonesia (Universitas Indonesia), the faculty opened its doors in October 1950.\textsuperscript{43} Despite the new organisational structure no major changes were made to the curriculum: it still basically followed the curriculum for civil engineers at the Institute of Technology in Delft. This implied that architecture and planning were secondary topics – while ‘planning’ apparently did not include ‘town’ planning.\textsuperscript{44}

Even though Sutoto suggested to discontinue the activities of the committee temporarily, the Committee on Spatial Planning continued work as normal: its members met again on February 10. Ir Putuhena, Sutoto’s successor, attended the meeting on March 29 and, like his minister ir Laoh, turned out to attribute great importance to spatial planning. Thus the committee was able to continue its work for well over a year and present Laoh the Bill on Spatial Planning in Indonesia in July 1951 (\textit{Wetsontwerp} 1951).\textsuperscript{45} Predominantly corresponding to the situation in the Netherlands and modelled after the Dutch Act on National Plan and Regional Plans (\textit{Wet Nationaal Plan en Streekplannen}, 1950-1965), the bill contained directives for a national plan, regional plans, the execution of detailed design schemes, procedures for approval and assessment, building by-laws, compensations and retributions. Like its Dutch equivalent, the Indonesian Bill on Spatial Planning meant to be a national plan for Indonesia or part of the country. The national plan would be specified into so-called ‘facet plans’ (partial plans) that would each represent a specific group or sector of interest. Thus the national plan would enable planners, designers and politicians to ascertain the needs and demands of various related themes and make decisions based on an overall understanding of the national and various sectoral interests. To compose and supervise the national plan the Committee on Spatial Planning urges the appointment of a permanent interdepartmental committee.

On account of Sukarno’s decision to liquidate the federal state the provincial level that was provided for in an earlier version of the bill, was left out. The second level on which plans were to be designed thus became the regional level. The bill laid down that either the regency or the Minister of Public Works and Power was entitled to decide on the need to design a regional plan. To work on a regional plan a special committee and preferably a planning bureau had to be appointed for survey and consultation with associated organisations. With regard to survey and design (C)PB could lend a hand when needed. An important implication of a regional plan was the necessity to present intended future developments out in the open so that everybody could learn about them. An important legal consequence was the possibility to claim rights on land based on a regional plan.

Once plans were drawn up and approved they needed to be elaborated in detail. Following the pre-war methodology these so-called ‘detailed planning schemes’ would be designed according to ‘circles’ (\textit{kringen}) that denominated their particular and distinctive function: building, open air, traffic, pipes and cables, agriculture, and nature. The legal importance of these detailed planning schemes was that they provided a legal foundation on which a building permit could be refused. With regard to building permits the bill in detail prescribed building types, admittance

\textsuperscript{43} Bandung accommodated the Faculty for Architecture run by prof. ir F. Dicke. The faculties for Medicine, Law, and Economics were established in Djakarta while Agriculture and Veterinary Sciences were based in Bogor. Prior to October 1950 the course for architecture in Bandung was referred to as ‘technical science’.

\textsuperscript{44} Interview prof. ir Sidharta (Semarang, 28-11-2000).

of building types within a particular circle, building line, technical and hygienic demands, application of a permit and grounds for refusal, standards for housing improvement, demands of roads along which would be build, aesthetics (‘welstand’ was deemed too old-fashioned a word), etc. With regard to a standardization of the building industry the authors stressed that a central regulation on planning would offer the advantage of a simplification of the housing industry and would therefore foster standardization in building types throughout the archipelago.  

The all-important issue of the acquisition of land and the regulation on the entitlement to damages as a result of planning measures was regulated in accordance with the 1948 Town Planning Ordinance. As this ordinance assumed that planning served a general interest, prevented chaotic situations to arise, and therefore offered financial and economic advantages, the bill and the ordinance stated that compensations were only to be considered in the exceptional event when the detriment was in no proportion to the effect of the planning intervention. It was not the final regulation that addressed land-issues, however. As time progressed and the assessment of the bill did not happen, the Ministry of Public Works and Power that was appointed to address any kind of construction or building works decided to end land distribution along European rights of ownership. Subsequently Agraria, a Directorate of the Ministry of Home Affairs, elaborated a resolution that granted Europeans and European legal bodies ground leases and building and planning rights for a period of thirty years, and leaseholds on land for fifty years.  

Based on available documents it is hard to determine whether and when the Bill on Spatial Planning was decreed. That its coming into force was postponed for at least three years becomes clear from a note by Thijssse written in 1954. While referring to the bill as an important means to control planning in areas outside the municipalities he for one attributed the postponement in passing the bill to ‘(…) the expectation that the execution of this law will be very difficult owing to lack of competent personnel’. Whether or not this situation changed later on the documents unfortunately do not tell.

1957: Finale and beginning

While political leaders set out to model Indonesia into one unified nation, the lack of experienced and sufficiently trained Indonesian civil servants initially frequently hindered processes that already started off. Though experience was scarce this seemed an almost negligible problem compared to the situation that arose when most Dutch professionals left Indonesia in 1957.

Once again the country was left with a void. But this time the void was soon filled up: almost immediately after Dutch planners and teachers left, colleagues from Austria, Germany, and the United States of America came in and took over. Their

---

46 The aspiration for uniformity as formulated in 1951 reflected earlier attempts. In the pre-war period Karsten already introduced schedules for building types that would at all times and at all places be available to designers. Also the 1948 Town Planning Ordinance paved the way for standardization in its regulation for the execution of detailed plans. NAI TA, J.W. Keiser, ‘Ruimtelijke Ordening in het Indonesië van omstreeks 1950’ (1980), 19; NAI TA, Jac.P. Thijsse, ‘Een vergelijking tussen Nederland en Nederlands Oost Indië tijdens de laatste eeuwisseling’ (ca. 1980).

47 The additional proposal to retro activate the agreement as of January 22 1949 was not seconded by the Ministry of Public Works. NAI TA, J.W. Keiser, ‘Rechtspositie van de percelen in de satellietstad Kotabaru-Kebayoran’ (1-7-1952), 10.


49 Professor for architecture, ir V.R. van Romondt, was the only Dutch architect who did not submit to the political situation and stayed in Indonesia until 1962.
arrival internationalised Indonesian planning: new and different views were imported that generated fundamental changes with regard to the outlook and methodology of planning. This for instance was noticeable in the educational system. In 1959 the Faculty of Architecture of the University of Indonesia (re)gained its independence and was renamed Institute of Technology Bandung (Institut Teknologi Bandung - ITB). Gradually changes and adjustments to the curriculum were carried through. This, among others, implied the introduction of town planning and landscape architecture, and an integrated approach of architecture. Around the same time an idea was launched to set up a full-fledged City and Regional Physical Planning School that would eventually develop into an autonomous institute for urban studies and research, and would not only direct its attention to Indonesia but to South- and South-East Asia as well. Although the envisioned institute was never established, ITB within the framework of United Nations assistance to Indonesia did run a course on regional and city planning from September 1959 until April 1965.

In 1961 the first cohort of Indonesian teachers with a foreign degree in architecture returned to Indonesia and took up positions as teachers: dipl.-ings. Han Awal, Bianpoen, Suyudi, and Suwondo from Berlin, and prof ir Hasan Poerbo from London. In hindsight they returned just in time. Due to continuous political turmoil the Americans in 1963 were forced to leave Indonesia only to return towards the end of the 1960’s. In line with the improved Indonesian-American political relationship, assistance with regard to education and planning was resumed. Gradually scholarships became available that increasingly enabled Indonesian students to study in the United States. In the early 1970’s this resulted in a second group of foreign educated Indonesian architects and planners. Trained and familiarized with the American approach and outlook on planning, it were these architects who introduced and applied American ideas, methodologies, and systems to Indonesian planning and slowly but surely generated a change in the originally very Dutch-focused Indonesian planning practice.

Two planning projects
Planning after the Second World War at various times required various solutions. Being the large town it was, Batavia and later Djakarta, often set the tone and served as a testing ground for new developments. This was the case when in 1948 and in 1962 new living areas were designed to accommodate a substantial segment of the town’s large number of inhabitants. The 1948 plan for Kebayoran Baru was launched to try and call a halt to the ever increasing number of Batavian inhabitants (513,115 in 1930 versus 2,973,052 in 1960) and its concomitant housing shortage. The 1962 the plan for Pulo Mas was designed with the idea to develop a model project for growing

50 Interview prof. ir Sidharta (Semarang, 28-11-2000).
51 The UN temporarily interrupted their support to the institute between July 1962 and July 1963, and again in 1965. Provided new objectives would be achieved – i.e. the establishment of a school for physical planning and urban and regional studies – resumption of UN-support was considered again in 1969. According to a UN-report on the programme various changes were needed with regard to the existent school. First an appropriate teaching staff had to be appointed in accordance with the curriculum. Secondly the knowledge of the teachers present had to be updated and furthered, and thirdly the output and standard of the graduates had to be increased. NAI TA, Letter ir J.W. Waworentoe, dd. 19-11-2003; NAI TA, Tentative Programme UN. Assistance to the Dep. of Regional and City Planning of the Bandung Institute of Technology.
52 Interviews dipl.-ing. Han Awal (Jakarta, 3-1-2001) and ir Adhi Moersid (Jakarta, 5-1-2001).
53 Interview ir Adhi Moersid (Jakarta, 5-1-2001).
towns of Indonesia and other Asian countries that would demonstrate ‘the advantages of the planned town’ and planned solutions when dealing with problems of mass housing and land occupation (Pulo Mas 1962:11). Both plans illustrate and create an insight into the planning practice at the respective periods, be it practical, organisational, legal, or ideological.

Kebayoran Baru: experiment out of necessity

The idea to build a new town in the vicinity of Batavia might well have been inspired by the way town plans in Europe and America were designed. A good example in this case might have been Patrick Abercrombie’s design for the Greater London Plan: a plan that projected several new towns that would be situated in a circle and at a considerable distance from London. Another explanation might be that the area around Kebayoran offered the rather unique opportunity to design and realize an entire plan in one move.

The plan to build Kebayoran was launched after the initial idea of July 1948 to move to the vicinity of Depok was abandoned as the army could not sufficiently guarantee the safety of a town that far removed from Batavia. Looking for a territory closer to Batavia the Ministry of Public Works and Reconstruction subsequently suggested to build the new town near the small village Kebayoran, just eight kilometres in a straight line removed from King’s Square (Koningsplein). Although this distance does not meet one of an essential requirements of a satellite-town (for that it should have been fifteen kilometres), this stipulation was soon disregarded as the area offered so many of other advantages: it was scenic, undulating, bordered by two small rivers, close to a train station, had a low building density, and provided good building soil (laterite) (Clason 1950a). Given the urgency of the matter and the suitability of the land the government approved the plan on September 21, 1948.

Prior to the assessment of the plan a Central Organisation for Reconstruction (Centrale Stichting Wederopbouw - CSW) was appointed in August and charged with the technical and financial responsibility for the development of Kebayoran. The Ministry of Home Affairs was made responsible for administrative and social issues. Under the auspices of CSW a Regional Construction Service (Regionaal Opbouw Bureau Kebayoran – ROB Kebayoran) was set up to execute the development of Kebayoran: the clearing of land, the construction of roads, buildings, drains, etc (Clason 1950b).

To coordinate and advise the planning of the new town the so-called Kebayoran Committee (Kebayoran Commissie) was appointed in January 1949 (Clason 1950b:27-8).

Right after the plan was endorsed, CSW in October 1948 started preparations for the redemption of titles to land and the arrangements for compensations. At the

---

56 Clason chaired the Kebayoran Committee as of August 1949. His predecessors were C. De Koning (May-August 1949), and M.A.F. Zwager (until May 1949). Clason was dismissed in April 1950 and replaced by ir S. Santoso.
57 The acquisition of land had always been a problem for Europeans because of the inalienability of rights on land to non-Indonesians. Forced by increasing political, economic and social changes during the nineteenth century and the consequential increased demand for land, Europeans established rules that suited both the Indonesian and European concepts of ownership – despite the many variations and nuances of Indonesian land rights unknown to Europeans. Thus, in line with the Compulsory Purchase Ordinance of 1920 that enabled Europeans to purchase land that was needed for a town extension or a
beginning of 1949 events happened in quick succession: on January 17, 1949 the whole area was expropriated, on February 11 Soesilo finished his first plan based on aerial photos and rough measurements, on March 3 the first engineer, ir C.J.E. Klencke, arrived, and on March 18 the foundation stone for Kebayoran was laid (Figure 4).

Figure 4. Plan for Kebayoran Baru (1948)

***


Three decades after the Kebayoran-plan was conceived Thijsse described it as exemplary for the way planning should be conceived as it was designed to (also) suit needs of the distant future. Following contemporary planning ideologies and in line with a traditional Indonesian notion of the planning of a settlement, the Kebayoran-plan from the start was a compromise between an autonomous town with its own administration on the one hand and a extensive residential area to an existing town on the other hand. Based on Karsten’s philosophies and set up according to the notion of districts, the plan distinguished various neighbourhoods with their own characteristics, segregated by streets or green belts. Grouped together according to their predominant function these neighbourhoods in turn formed clearly distinguished zones (kringen). Thus the 730 hectares of land of Kebayoran were divided and appointed for buildings (nine different categories, occupying fifty percent of the territory), roads, public gardens, sports fields, etc. (the other fifty percent). Although initially intended to predominantly house lowest income groups, adjustments to the initial lay-out and distribution of the various housing types were made when it became clear that it were basically the moderate and higher income groups that were interested to move to the new area because they preferred the relatively small houses equipped with all modern comforts to the large, pre-war houses in Batavia.

It would not be the only adjustments and changes that would happen to Kebayoran Baru. Thus for example one of the conditions Thijsse pointed out to


60 To simplify the building procedures and to guarantee a certain building standard ‘housing schedules’ were used. NAi TA, Bijlage Table of building-types according to the building bylaw of Kebajoran, opgesteld door Central Office for Physical Planning of the Department of Irrigation and Reconstruction (October 1948).
guarantee successful planning was difficult to put into practice: the conscientious application of the building by-law. From the start it proved hard to comply with one of the main regulations that marked and guaranteed the autonomous and self-sustainable character of the new town namely the prohibition to construct any building along the connecting four lane road between Batavia and Kebayoran and in a ring of one kilometre width around Kebayoran Baru. Violating a regulation like this threatened the original set up of the plan from an ideological point of view as well as from a pragmatic point of view.

Similar and different problems would occur. Like anywhere else in Indonesia, the re-organisations and staff changes after December 1949 also struck the Kebayoran Baru set-up. In April 1950 ROB Kebayoran was placed under the wings of CSW. Two months later, on June 1, 1950 it was renamed Office for Kebayoran Baru New Town Public Works (Djawatan Pekerjaan Umum Kota Baru Kebayoran) and placed under direct auspices of the Ministry of Public Works. During the second half of that same year ir Poerbodiningrat was appointed director of CSW. These successive re-organisations gradually deprived CSW of what had by and large become its main task namely the execution of the new town Kebayoran. As a result Putuhena’s proposal to liquidate CSW was accepted and executed by presidential order on April 25, 1951. CSW’s former responsibility for the development and housing company were taken over by the Office for Kebayoran Baru New Town Public Works as of November 5, 1951.

Meanwhile selling land and letting houses proved increasingly difficult despite the adjustments that were made earlier to meet the demands and desires of future inhabitants of the new town. Two years after work in Kebayoran had started only 251 parcels of land (for which 86 deeds of sale were signed), and 105 houses (for which 46 deeds of sale were signed) had found their way to customers. Under Indonesian right of ownership three parcels and thirteen houses were sold. Furthermore 1,713 social houses and small houses were rented, 1,940 governments houses were rented by civil servants, and 87 houses owned by Arabs were or were going to be hire purchased. Notwithstanding the troublesome exploitation of Kebayoran, Sukarno in 1951 aggravated the situation when, on the same day he granted the liquidation of CSW, he annulled arrangements made for the redemption and transfer of right of ownership to land from Indonesians to the CSW with retrospective force as of January 1, 1950 – a decision that no doubt created great confusion to the legal situation and ownership of many plots of land.

When Kebayoran Baru was eventually finished in 1954 it did not fulfil the goals set at the outset. With 45,627 inhabitants it only housed 75% of the original

---

62 Though (C)PB’s Building By-Law for Kebayoran was never decreed it nonetheless functioned as guideline. NAI TA, J.W. Keiser, ‘Rechtspositie van de percelen in de satellietstad Kotabaru- Kebayoran’ (1-7-1952); NAI TA, Jac.P. Thijssse, ‘Een vergelijking tussen Nederland en Nederlands Oost Indië tijdens de laatste eeuwwisseling’ (ca. 1980).
63 Poerbodiningrat was appointed Director of the Housing Office and the Central Planning Bureau in January, 1951, and professor for architecture at the Faculty of Technology in Jogjakarta.
64 NAI TA, J.W. Keiser, ‘Rechtspositie van de percelen in de satellietstad Kotabaru-Kebayoran’ (1-7-1952).
plan, and of the planned 7,050 houses only 4,720 houses were built. Likewise the number of other facilities fell short: the 142 shop and public buildings, 14 schools, 1 mosque, 1 church, 3 markets, and 1 cinema did not meet the intended figures of respectively 309, 28, 4, 3, 4, and 4 (Handinoto 1954). Even though many of the original plan’s objectives were never realised (many changes occurred since its completion, and maintaining it self-sustaining character was difficult, if not impossible) Kebayoran Baru today in many parts and ways is a pleasant district where spacious residential areas with abundant green spaces and busy business areas alternate in an enjoyable way and it is considered the centre of Jakarta by many.

Pulo Mas: immaterialised model project
Pulo Mas was set up as a pioneering, prestigious low-cost housing project in the vicinity of Jakarta.68 Developed in the early 1960’s, it was the first comprehensive attempt on town, regional and national planning in Indonesia to demonstrate the advantages of planned solutions to problems of mass housing for low-income groups and the occupation of land (Herbowo et al. 1961). Unlike any other plan designed and developed so far in Indonesia, Pulo Mas’ was the first area that was based on pedestrians rather than cars as a starting point for its set-up. As such, the plan was intended to become a model project on housing for low-income groups and meant to be applied in other parts of Jakarta and other Indonesian towns.

The ideas and designs for Pulo Mas were executed within a post-graduate programme on residential, town and regional planning at the Department of Town Planning of the Royal Danish Academy of Fine Arts in Copenhagen (Denmark) between 1960 and 1963. Founded in cooperation with the Regional Housing Centre Bandung and with the support of the Danish Government Committee for Technical Assistance and the United Nations Technical Assistance Programme, the course offered three Indonesian architects the possibility to continue their studies abroad: ir Herbowo, ir Kandar Tisnawanata, and later on Radinal Moochtar (Herbowo et al. 1961).69 Otherwise the design team principally consisted of Danish planners.

In line with current contemporary planning methodologies and to acquaint the whole team with Indonesian circumstances in general and Jakarta’s circumstances in particular, the Indonesian students, prior to designing, collected data on geography, topography, climate, economy, population demography, transport, and education. Thus they were able to argue why the area to the east of Jakarta would be suitable to accommodate a large low-cost housing area – and thus with retrospective effect substantiate the area that was already pointed out for the project by dr Soemarno, governor of Jakarta. Their studies showed that the site was a perfect location for an extensive low-cost housing project. The area was only five kilometres removed from Merdeka Square, flat, adjacent to a river, close to arterial roads leading out of Jakarta to the east, occupied with temporary dwellings for rice- and other farmers, and owned by only a few land owners. The last two arguments were important as they made acquisition of the land relatively easy and cheap.70

68 Interview ir Kandar Tisnawinata (Jakarta, 9-12-2000).
69 The idea to invite two of three selected Indonesian architects was launched by Philip Arctander, architect and director at the Danish Institute of Building Research. His proposal followed an earlier (1957) proposal by Bo Jensen to set up a post-graduate training for qualified architects from developing countries that in a way resembled the training offered by The Architectural Associations School in London (Great Britain) at their Department for Tropical Architecture.
70 The plan provided new accommodation for the rice- and other farmers that would be forced to leave the lands in a suitable, nearby area.
After investigating and considering all conditions of the site in relation to the existing situation and city, the team designed a plan (*Pulo Mas* 1962). Covering 270 hectares of land and intended to house approximately twenty to fifty thousand people, the plan echoed Indonesian administrative hierarchy in a contemporary lay-out. Divided in four separate neighbourhoods and centred around a commercial and business axis, the plan applied zoning, segregated various traffic modes, amply provided pedestrian areas, and advocated standardization (Figure 5). Following customs in Indonesian settlements, each ‘finger’ of the neighbourhood consisted of four housing units (*rukun tetangga*, RT) that formed one neighbourhood unit (*rukun warga*, RW). Four neighbourhood units formed one city quarter (*kelurahan*), and four city quarters formed one sub-district (*kecamatan*). The roads system, apart from the slightly undulated central axis, was laid out in a rectangular pattern. It also showed a hierarchic structure: housing units were made up of pedestrian streets only, neighbourhood units were bordered by streets for wheeled traffic, and city quarters were surrounded by roads for motorised traffic. Industrial activities were located all along the northern edge of the plan. The rest of the plan was designed in such a way that housing, commercial-, public- and sport facilities, and occasional industry were evenly spread over all four quarters and density increased towards the centre of these and around the central axis. As far as housing was concerned various types were provided: high-rise until eight stories high, two-storied-, semi-detached, and detached houses. As the plan was specifically designed for low-income groups, the plan abundantly provided pedestrian routes and appropriate houses. The whole plan, layout as well as building types, were designed in a contemporary style adapted to Indonesian circumstances that would offer enough flexibility to allow and anticipate inevitable future adjustments to meet new social, economic and technological demands.

The plan for *Pulo Mas* met one of the objectives of the 1957 Outline Plan for Jakarta namely the need for peripheral developments and for the creation of self-contained settlements at a reasonable distance from the original town over the next twenty years (*Pulo Mas* 1962). This basis for any planning activity was deemed necessary in order to address the city’s increasing demands for housing, work, and traffic, to prevent over-extension, to guarantee systematic extension, and to prevent congested roads. Despite the seemingly perfect fit and its approval by Sukarno in 1963, implementation of the original plan was difficult due to lack of financial means. In order to realize the plan one way or another, the planners were then forced to adjust the design in such a way that it would financially be feasible to implement it. Thus, to adjust the needs and demands of middle- and high income groups, a considerable number of high rise and two-storey buildings were replaced by larger and more expensive detached houses. Furthermore the central axis that was to be the ‘town centre’ was taken out and replaced by a horse racetrack. As a result of these adjustments the density rate dropped by four-fifth: whereas the initial the plan was calculated to accommodate 500 people per hectare, this figure decreased to 100

---

71 Self-contained settlements were seen as a solution for any town that grew rapidly. The design team for *Pulo Mas* consisted of the Indonesian architects Herbowo, Kandar Tisnawinata, and Radinal Moochtar and the Canadian architect Ove C. Simonsen. On the Danish side prof. Peter Bredsdorff, Flemming Jørgensen, Peter S. Overgaard, Philip Arctander, Ole Dybbroe, Klaus Blach, Steensen and Varming consulting engineers and the Danish Health Society were involved. Kenneth Watts represented the United Nations.

72 Other projects that started from the same premise concerned Grogol, Slipi, and Tebet. Due to lack of know how and financial resourced these projects were designed by the Ministry of Public Works (Pekerjaan Umum).
people per hectare. Though from a financial point of view the adjustments were opportune, they thoroughly undermined not only the pragmatic foundation of the plan, but also - and maybe even more fundamental – the ideological foundation of the plan was thwarted. The opportunity to construct a low-cost housing area based on contemporary and Indonesian planning principles was thus lost.

Figure 5. Model Pulo Mas (1962)

***


Instead of utilizing Pulo Mas as an exemplary method to address the housing shortage among for low-income groups, Ali Sadikin, governor of Jakarta, in 1969 decided to concentrate on the improvement of existing kampongs in the centre of town. To what extent this decision was prompted by financial or other reasons is not clear. What is clear, though, is that without downplaying the merits of kampong improvement projects, these projects did not build the houses nor the neighbourhoods that were so desperately needed in Jakarta and other major cities. Moreover, by abandoning the Pulo Mas project the government of Jakarta missed an early opportunity to benefit from the project to develop, elaborate, and lay down principles, procedures, and objectives for extensive housing projects that could address the housing shortage and suit the low-income groups anywhere in Indonesia.

Conclusion
The emergence and development of spatial planning during the first half of the twentieth century in Indonesia took place against a backdrop of significant changes on a political and an administrative level. But although the Indonesian Declaration of Independence and the official transfer of Dutch sovereignty to Indonesia marked a radical change in the political – and consequently economic, social, and cultural – spectrum, it were the administrative changes that stimulated effectively the establishment and development of an methodological planning practice.

Once the Decentralisation Act (1903) and the Local Council Ordinance (1905) were enforced that made local authorities directly responsible for the economic, social, and physical development of their communities it soon became clear that the dispersion of only a small group of professions throughout the archipelago made cooperation necessary and inevitable if the municipalities wanted to address the amount and variety of various (urgent) planning issues successfully. From 1910 onward annual conferences, preliminary reports, and professional journals offered administrators, architects, doctors, jurists, and other experts a platform to share and exchange thoughts and experiences with regard to every aspect of planning. It was thus that the foundation of a methodological planning that was very much rooted in the Dutch and western-European tradition was laid.

 Allegedly the United Nations not only technically but also financially supported the kampong improvement projects.
After the transfer of sovereignty (1949) and the abolishment of the federal state (1950), the Indonesian administration slowly but surely re-established a centralised government. From a planning perspective this change, initially, did not entail a drastic change: the prevailing Town Planning Ordinance (presented in 1938, legalized in 1948), the new Bill on Spatial Planning (presented in 1951), and the curriculum at the universities were all still based on the Dutch paradigm.

But not before long. The Dutch views and approaches that had ruled Indonesian planning for so long were about to be replaced by American concepts and ideas. The impetus to this change was initiated when, as a result of a debate over New Guinea, Indonesian-Dutch relations became completely disrupted in 1957 and positions formerly held by Dutch professionals were taken over by other Europeans and North Americans. Although no immediate effect on the planning practice was noticeable, the situation gradually changed during the 1960’s. By the early 1970’s planners and architects increasingly turned towards North American paradigms and more rigorous changes were made with regard to planning methodologies, outlooks, and the educational system. Simultaneously the introduction of a Guided Democracy (1959) and an altogether new political order (Orde Baru) (1965) steadily lead to a centralised government. As a result planning gradually turned into a discipline that hardly left any space for local needs or adjustments. When a radical political reformation in 1998 offered the opportunity to fundamentally change the prevailing status quo, the opportunity to decentralise the government was utilized which resulted in the implementation of a decentralisation policy as of January 2002.

As the recent decentralisation is still very much in its infancy it is too early to state anything about the effect of this new policy. Comparing circumstances at the introduction of the past and the present decentralisation one can distinguish some parallels though: the direct confrontation with and responsibility for local circumstances, the need for sufficient expertise and experts on a local, regional, provincial, and national level, and the necessity to develop an educational system that provides enough students with the required knowledge, understanding, and tools to address the variety and number of topics referring to planning and related issues. A major difference today is that contemporary administrators and planners, unlike their colleagues of almost a century ago, do not have to start from scratch and can make use of abundant resources of historical experiences and examples. Experiences and examples that could - and should - be used as stepping stones to define present and future directions for planning in Indonesia.

References

Archival documents
Nederlands Architectuur Instituut (NAi), Rotterdam
Thijsse archief (TA).

Arsip Nasional Republik Indonesia (ANRI), Jakarta

Published sources
Bouwbeperingencommissie

Clason, E.W.H.

Granpré Molière, M.J.

Handinoto, K.

Herbowo, Kandar Tisnawanata and Radinal Moochtar
1961  Compilation of data on Indonesia presented as a collection of tools for future planning. Copenhagen: Royal Danish Academy of Fine Arts, Department of Town Planning.

Kloos, W.B.

Niessen, Nicole
1999  Municipal government in Indonesia: Policy, law, and practice of decentralization and urban spatial planning. Leiden: Research School CNWS School of Asian, African, and Amerindian Studies. [CNWS publications 77.]

Nix, Thomas

Planologische

Pulo Mas
1962  Pulo Mas Sketch Project. Copenhagen: Royal Danish Academy of Fine Arts, Department of Town Planning.

Regeeringsalmanak

Rückert, J.J.G.E
Samenstelling

Stadsvormingsordonnantie
1938 *Stadsvormingsordonnantie stads gemeenten Java*. Batavia: Landsdrukkerij.

Thijsse, Jac.P.

Toelichting
1938 *Toelichting op de “stadsvormingsordonnantie stads gemeenten Java”*. Batavia: Landsdrukkerij.

Wetsontwerp
1951 *Wetsontwerp op de Ruimtelijke Ordening*. Jakarta.
The Spatial Planning Programme (LROP) of Lower Saxony has been revised and amended in 2008 and 2012. Three current drafts of the plan exist due to amendment processes in 2014, 2015 and 2016. Greece. No MSP plan at national level; sectoral plans only; as a Member State of the EU must have maritime spatial plan in place by 2021; a draft law on the establishment of a framework for MSP, which establishes the principles and procedures for the design, implementation and assessment of the country's MSP, has been submitted to Parliament in May 2018; Greece has. Planning theory is the body of scientific concepts, definitions, behavioral relationships, and assumptions that define the body of knowledge of urban planning. There are nine procedural theories of planning that remain the principal theories of planning procedure today: the rational-comprehensive approach, the incremental approach, the Transformative Incremental (TI) approach, the transactive approach, the communicative approach, the advocacy approach, the equity approach, the radical approach, and Theme: Spatial Planning and Territorial Governance. Scope. Since then, the EU has expanded to 28 member states and there have been significant developments in pan-European territorial and cohesion policies. Territorial governance and spatial planning systems have now evolved to become one of the key components of integrated cross-sectoral development strategies and policy delivery mechanisms among ESPON member and partner states. For further reading please see below. Policy questions. What changes in territorial governance and spatial planning systems and policies can be observed across Europe over the past 15 years? Can these changes be attributed to